

AADE Working Directive

This directive has been accepted on April 09, 2019 dated AEADEP General Assembly.

ARTICLE 1 - Basis and Objective

This directive has been prepared in accordance with Articles 12, 15, and 17 of the Association for Accreditation of Dental Education (AADE). Its objective is to determine the principles regarding the functioning of the boards, commissions, and working groups that will work as an AADE body.

ARTICLE 2- Scope

This directive covers the issues that need to be determined by the decision of the General Assembly regarding the operation of the association.

ARTICLE 3- Abbreviations

The following abbreviations refer to:

AADE: Association for Accreditation of Dental Education

AADE BOD: Board of Directors of the Association for Accreditation of Dental Education

AADE GA: General Assembly of the Association for Accreditation of Dental Education

AADE SB: Supervisory Board of the Association for Accreditation of Dental Education

CDD: Council of Deans of Dentistry

CEC: Counseling and Education Commission

CHE: Council of Higher Education

EP: Evaluator Pool

IDEAB: International Dentistry Education Accreditation Board

MR: Monitoring Report

NDEAB: National Dentistry Education Accreditation Board

SER: The Self Evaluation Report to be prepared by the Faculties of Dentistry

SDDC: Standard Determination and Development Commission

TDA: Turkish Dental Association

ARTICLE 4- National Dentistry Education Accreditation Board (NDEAB)

National Dentistry Education Accreditation Board (NDEAB) is a body established under AADE to work within the framework of the objectives listed in Article 2 of the AADE bylaw

and established in accordance with the paragraphs 4.1, 4.2, 4.3, and 4.4 of this article. It can take and implement decisions within the framework determined by the directive.

4.1- Duties of NDEAB

- a. To make and implement decisions regarding the accreditation of pre-graduate education programs of all dentistry faculties recognized by CHE on behalf of AADE,
- b. To determine the members who will take part in the program evaluation teams from the evaluator pool,
- c. To determine the visit, evaluation, and accreditation processes of educational institutions and to approve timeline programs,
- d. To present to the AADE Board of Directors the amendment proposals it deems necessary regarding the current accreditation processes and evaluation criteria,
- e. To ensure the coordination of its sub-committees and working groups, to establish working groups related to the field of activity, when necessary,
- f. To ensure that the content of NDEAB on the official website of the association is up-to-date and maintained.

4.2- Formation, Members, and Term of Office of NDEAB

NDEAB members, who are dentistry lecturers, are selected from an evaluator pool. A person cannot act as a rector, vice-rector, advisor to the rector, dean, vice-dean, college director, college vice-principal, chief physician and deputy chief physician, and a member of NDEAB at the same time.

NDEAB consists of 17 (seventeen) members as follows. Assigned by AADE BOD:

- a. 10 (ten) lecturers of dentistry faculties, including all departments in dentistry, which are in the dentistry education determined by AADE BOD, among experienced faculty members in dentistry education, management, accreditation, and quality processes (at least 1 year of experience in positions such as dean, vice-dean, education coordinator, quality commission, term coordinator)
- b. 1 (one) member of AADE BOD appointed by the Board of Directors,
- c. 1 (one) member recommended by the Ministry of Health and graduated from the Faculty of Dentistry at most 3 years ago, 1 (one) member appointed with the recommendation of TDA and experienced in education, quality, and accreditation processes,
- d. 1 (one) member who works in the TDA education commission, assigned with the recommendation of TDA,
- e. 2 (two) undergraduate dentistry students, proposed for student representation by the relevant faculties, one of which is new and the other old in the order of the establishment year of the faculties, and does not have the right to vote, to take part in the board for 3 (three) years,
- f. 1 (one) community representative who is not related to the profession.

Membership of NDEAB starts in January, and lasts 3 (three) years, except for the members who have served for 3 (three) years and served as chairperson, they cannot serve for more than 3 (three) consecutive terms. Members whose term of office expires are reassigned by AADE BOD or new members are appointed in their place. Member(s) are determined by AADE BOD to replace the members who had to leave the duty before the end of their term of office.

4.3- Election and Re-determination of NDEAB Chairperson, Vice-chair, and Members

a. NDEAB elects 3 (three) persons, a chairperson, a vice-chair, and a reporter, among the members who meet the conditions specified in Article 4.2. The term of office of the NDEAB chairperson and vice-chair is 3 (three) years. These terms cannot be extended. The chairperson and vice-chair cannot hold the same office for two consecutive terms.

b. In the event that the chairperson and/or vice-chair leaves office, a new chairperson and/or vice-chair is elected.

4.4- NDEAB Meetings and Working Principles

a. The chairperson of NDEAB is responsible for the functioning of NDEAB. In the absence of the chairperson, the NDEAB vice-chair conducts the operation of NDEAB on behalf of the chairperson.

b. NDEAB holds at least 4 (four) meetings every year. The NDEAB meeting call, together with the agenda, is notified to the NDEAB members and the chairperson of the AADE BOD in writing and/or by e-mail at least two (2) weeks in advance by the NDEAB chairperson.

c. NDEAB members have to attend NDEAB meetings in person. They cannot send a representative instead. The membership of a person who does not attend three consecutive meetings without giving an excuse to the Chairperson's office is automatically terminated.

d. A CDD member can attend NDEAB meetings without voting rights to establish the connection between CDD and NDEAB.

He/she cannot appoint a non-CDD representative.

e. NDEAB meetings are held with an absolute majority and are open to the participation of AADE BOD members without voting rights.

f. Accreditation decisions are taken with at least ten (10) votes, and all other decisions are taken by the absolute majority of the members attending the meeting.

g. Virtual meetings can be organized by using communication and voting tools such as mail, fax, e-mail, and website in cases where urgent discussion and decision-making are required apart from the regular NDEAB meetings and accreditation decisions. However, the conditions stated in (e) and (f) above apply to the decisions in such meetings.

h. NDEAB members can participate in the work of all AADE commissions without the right

to vote, except for organizational visits.

i. In all other matters not included in this directive, the AADE bylaw and the AADE BOD decisions are taken into account.

ARTICLE 5: Evaluator Pool (EP), Program Evaluation Teams, and Program Evaluators

5.1. Evaluator Pool

It consists of people who visited the faculties where it was decided to make an evaluation visit, prepared a program evaluation report, and informed NDEAB, who received the evaluator training, and who answered all the questions correctly in the evaluation exam. A person cannot work in the rector, vice-rector, advisor to the rector, dean, vice-dean, college director, college vice principal, chief physician and assistant chief physician, and evaluator pool at the same time. Every year, Deanships of the Faculty of Dentistry, CDD, and AADE propose candidates to form the evaluator pool. These candidates are required to have received evaluator training. It can propose a maximum of 3 candidates per year from each Faculty of Dentistry. Persons who will take part in EP must be members of AADE.

5.2. Program Evaluation Teams

Accreditation evaluations are made by program evaluation teams. Program evaluation teams are formed by NDEAB. A separate evaluation team is established for each organization whose programs will be evaluated. There is at least one student evaluator in each team that includes an overall evaluation. The rules to be followed in the working procedures and principles of the program evaluation teams are regulated by the Evaluation and Accreditation Implementation Principles Directive to be approved and published by AADE BOD. Program Evaluation Teams consist of 5 (five) full and 2 (two) substitute members appointed by AADE BOD from EP, AADE boards, and commissions according to the following characteristics. AADE BOD may appoint an observer member or additional member when necessary.

- a. A reporter/head of the team (1 member) from the members of the NDEAB Article 4.1 Clause a, 3 members, preferably at least 1 Basic Science Faculty Member from the Dentistry Lecturers of the Faculties of Dentistry
- b. Dentistry Undergraduate Student (1 member)

5.3 Program Evaluators

- a. Evaluators are selected from a pool of program evaluators, which includes experienced persons in Dentistry Faculties, in accordance with the program to be evaluated.

- b. Each program evaluator must have completed a training program provided by AADE before taking part in the visits. It is also strongly recommended to be a co-evaluator or observer on a visiting team.
- c. Academic members are expected to be experienced in quality improvement, continuous improvement, and accreditation preparation in programs accredited in Turkey and/or abroad.
- d. Members other than academic members must be specialized in dentistry education and experienced in at least one of the areas of quality processes.
- e. While determining the persons to be included in the program evaluator pool, other characteristics such as academic title, male/female balance, and inter-organizational balance are also taken into account.

5.4. Student Evaluators

- a. Selected student evaluator candidates must be enrolled in a dentistry education undergraduate program on the date of their selection.
- b. The selected student evaluator candidates must not have received any disciplinary action.
- c. Selected student evaluator candidates must prepare for the job by participating in AADE student evaluator training.

5.5 Observers

- a. When necessary, AADE members, evaluator candidates, and representatives from domestic and foreign accreditation institutions can participate in the evaluation teams as observers, provided that the approval of the team heads and relevant institutions is obtained and upon the decision of NDEAB.
- b. Within the scope of AADE's cooperation with foreign accreditation institutions, a representative from one of these organizations can participate as an external observer in at least one of the program evaluation teams formed every year. Organizations to be asked for external observers and relevant regulations are determined by AADE BOD.
- c. External observers submit their reports to AADE- BOD at the end of the evaluation visit. The evaluation and use of this report in the improvement processes are under the authority and responsibility of AADE BOD.

ARTICLE 6: AADE Training Programs

- a. All new AADE BOD and Supervisory Board members are informed about AADE policies and their operation.

- b. Evaluators included in the program evaluator pool are required to receive training. Program evaluators are required to attend the evaluator training program every 5 years to update themselves. With this training, it is ensured that all program evaluators know the NDEAB evaluation criteria to the required depth and acquire the skills and behaviors expected from the evaluation team members.
- c. Student evaluator candidates are required to receive training before taking part in AADE evaluation teams.
- d. AADE organizes training and information activities for the members of organizations that are considering making an evaluation application for accreditation.
- e. The organization of AADE training programs is done by the Training Committee to be established by the AADE BOD. The Training Committee consists of at least 7 (seven) members. This committee elects a chairperson and a secretary for a 3-year term. Members are determined by NDEAB as explained below and for 3 (three) years [FŞ1]. 1. NDEAB member (1 Member) 2. Basic Sciences (1 Member) 3. Members from the Clinical Sciences Department of the Faculty of Dentistry (5 Members) Working principles of the Training Committee are regulated by the Training Committee Directive to be approved and published by the AADE BOD.
- f. Prepares documents (such as application form, and guide) to inform organizations in line with National Dentistry Education Accreditation Standards.

ARTICLE 7: AADE Accreditation Standards

- a. The standards used in the program evaluations to be made by NDEAB determine the minimum conditions that a dentistry education program must meet for accreditation.
- b. A Standards Committee is established by AADE BOD to periodically review and update the standards, determine discipline-specific criteria for new programs, and carry out similar studies on criteria. The working principles directive is approved by AADE.
- c. The duties of the standards committee are to determine national standards for dentistry education programs in our country by evaluating universal rules and standards and national requirements together, to prepare evaluation criteria and guidelines for these standards, and to ensure their continuous development. After the criteria determined by the committee are approved by AADE BOD, they are published and distributed to Faculties of Dentistry and all relevant institutions to be implemented in the next term.
- d. The committee consists of at least 12 (twelve) members. This committee elects a chairperson and a secretary for a 3-year term. The student member is determined by AADE from among

the suggestions of the faculties for 3 (three) years. Without a representative from all faculties giving graduates, another student representative cannot be appointed from the same faculty. Members are determined by NDEAB as explained below and for 3 (three) years [FŞ1].

1. NDEAB member (1 Member)
 2. Basic Sciences (2 Members)
 3. 1 member representing the clinical sciences departments of the Faculties of Dentistry (8 Members)
 4. Dentistry Undergraduate Education Program Student (1 Member)
- e. In the changes to be made in AADE accreditation standards, the opinions of the dentistry faculties of universities in Turkey, representatives of their students, and similar external stakeholders as well as internal stakeholders such as NDEAB, AADE members, and NDEAB evaluators are sought.
- f. The changes in the standards are put into practice with the decision of AADE BOD, effective from the next evaluation period.

ARTICLE 8: Conflict and/or Conflict of Interest

- a. The duty of AADE BOD, Supervisory Board, and NDEAB membership may create situations that may lead to questions regarding the impartiality and dignity of the evaluation process, or conflicts of interest and/or conflicts. AADE BOD, Supervisory Board, and NDEAB members are expected to behave professionally and ethically, disclose real or apparent conflicts and/or conflicts of interest, and stay away from discussions and decisions that may be related to real or apparent conflicts and/or conflicts of interest.
- b. Similarly, duties such as head of the evaluation team, co-chairperson, program evaluator, and co-evaluator may create situations that may lead to questioning or conflicts of interest regarding the impartiality and dignity of the evaluation process. AADE expects these persons to act professionally and ethically, disclose real or apparent conflicts of interest, and stay away from discussions and decisions that may be related to real or apparent conflicts of interest.
- c. The objectives of this policy are listed below
 - 1) To ensure the dignity of the evaluation process and the reliability of the decisions of AADE BOD, Supervisory Board, and NDEAB members, program evaluators, and co-evaluators.
 - 2) To guarantee a fair and impartial decision-making process.
 - 3) To ensure impartial behavior and to prevent behaviors that may give the impression of not

being impartial.

d. NDEAB members, AADE, and persons representing NDEAB, if they have a close and active relationship with, or have been in the past, a program or institution that is in the decision process for AADE or NDEAB, do not participate in the decision-making process regarding that organization. The close and active relationship includes, but is not limited to:

1) Currently working as a lecturer, staff member, or consultant in the organization or program, or having worked in the past.

2) Having or having conducted interviews or discussions to serve in the organization or program.

3) Having been a student of the organization.

4) Having received an honorary degree from the organization.

5) A close relative to be a student or employee of the organization or program.

6) Having a non-remunerative affiliation with the organization (for example, a member of the organization's board of trustees or industrial advisory board, etc.).

e. All individuals who will represent NDEAB and therefore AADE must sign two separate forms: a "Conflict of Interest Statement Form" and a "Confidentiality and Ethics Commitment (Statement)" stating that they will not cause situations that will create a conflict of interest and that they have read and understood these principles.

f. The team leader, co-chairperson and evaluators, and co-evaluators to be assigned during the evaluation process are also requested to make a written statement that they do not have real or apparent conflicts of interest with the organizations and persons related to the program they will evaluate.

g. Individuals cannot attend the parts of the NDEAB meetings where the issues that they have real or apparent conflicts of interest are discussed or decisions are made. The names of those who declare that they are unauthorized due to conflicts of interest in a meeting are recorded. Actual or apparent conflict/conflict of interest occurs when:

1) Having a close and active relationship with a program or organization.

2) Having a monetary or personal relationship.

3) Having a reason that will prevent the person from making an unbiased decision.

ARTICLE 9 - The International Dental Education Accreditation Board (IDEAB) determines the standards, processes, and tools required for the accreditation of the undergraduate education programs of Faculties of Dentistry abroad on behalf of AADE. Its formation, duties, members,

and processes are determined by a directive to be prepared by AADE BOD.

ARTICLE 10 - Confidentiality

- a. The information provided by the institutions is used confidentially by the members of the AADE board and commission and cannot be disclosed without the written permission of the relevant organization. However, the AADE BOD may use the information and documents obtained from the accreditation processes in its reports and presentations without revealing the identity of the organization.
- b. The content of the material distributed for evaluation and discussion at AADE BOD and board meetings are considered confidential information.
- c. The contents of such documents and accreditation decisions can only be disclosed by authorized persons and under defined conditions.
- d. Members of AADE Boards, AADE employees, and program evaluators sign two separate forms: a "Conflict of Interest Statement Form" and a "Confidentiality and Ethics Commitment", stating that they understand and will abide by these confidentiality principles.

ARTICLE 11- Transparency and Accountability

AADE has the responsibility to inform and account for all its stakeholders and the public regarding program evaluation and accreditation activities. For this purpose, the following information and documents are published on its web page (www.DEPAD.org):

- a. Bylaws and directive(s) that determine the purposes and functioning of AADE and the boards,
- b. National standards used for evaluation and accreditation,
- c. Self-evaluation report format, evaluation process, and method, and similar documents that clearly define the evaluation and accreditation process and scope for higher education institutions that will apply to AADE for program evaluation and accreditation,
- d. Study reports and publications summarizing the work of AADE, including its evaluation and accreditation activities,
- e. List of AADE accredited programs and accreditation information and results reports.

ARTICLE 12 - Storage of AADE Documents

- a. Documents and reports related to AADE studies are regularly archived and stored. The AADE BOD Chairperson ensures that AADE's official documents and reports are securely archived and stored.

- b. AADE records the list of accredited programs, and the types and validity periods of the accredited accreditations.
- c. The methods and duration of storage of documents and reports related to AADE's work, including documents and reports regarding the accreditation process and results, are regulated by the Archiving Directive, approved and published by AADE BOD.

ARTICLE 13 -AADE office

13.1. General Secretary

The AADE General Secretary carries out the representation and coordination activities, the scope of which is determined by the AADE BOD. The General Secretary is responsible to AADE BOD.

13.2. AADE Commercial Enterprise

The Commercial Enterprise carries out the activities and all kinds of monetary transactions related to these activities, the scope of which is determined by the AADE BOD, in accordance with the AADE Regulation. The Commercial Enterprise is managed by one or more directors appointed by the AADE BOD. Administrative Managers are responsible to AADE BOD.

ARTICLE 14- Amendment to the Directive

- a. Suggestions for changes to this directive and the date from which it should come into force are submitted by AADE BOD to AADE GA. Directive changes that also require a bylaw change are submitted to the AADE GA with the proposal for a bylaw change.
- b. The proposals for the amendment of the directive prepared by the AADE BOD are placed on the agenda of the first meeting of the AADEP GA and decided upon.

ARTICLE 15- Enforcement and Execution

- a. This directive comes into effect from the date it is approved by AADE GA.
- b. The provisions of this directive are executed by the Chairperson of AADE.
- c. AADE BOD is responsible for making regulations and making decisions on all matters other than the provisions of this directive.